

1 PHILADELPHIA CITY COMMISSIONERS

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9 RETURN BOARD CERTIFICATION MEETING

10

Monday, September 30, 2024

11

9:00 a.m.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ATTENDANCE

- OMAR SABIR - CHAIRMAN
- KHALIF CHESTNUT - SIT-IN FOR DEPUTY TO THE CHAIR,  
VINCENT GOWANS
- LISA DEELEY - VICE-CHAIR
- NICHOLAS CUSTODIO - DEPUTY TO VICE-CHAIR
- SETH BLUESTEIN - COMMISSIONER
- ERIC KAPENSTEIN - DEPUTY
- JOSEPH LYNCH - DIRECTOR OF OPERATIONS
- STEPHANIE REED - DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATIONS
- DANA ECKROADE - DEPUTY DIRECTOR OF COMPLIANCE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

P R O C E E D I N G S

(9:00 a.m.)

CHAIRMAN SABIR: I call to order the meeting of the Philadelphia City Commissioners Return Board for Monday, September the 30th, 2024. This meeting is in compliance with the Pennsylvania Sunshine Act. The Philadelphia City Commissioners are a three-member bipartisan board of elected officials in charge of elections and voter registration for the county of Philadelphia. Each commissioner is elected to serve a four-year term that coincides with the municipal election cycle for mayor and city council.

The commissioner set and enforced departmental policies to administer voter registration and conduct elections in accordance with federal and state voter registration and election laws. The city commissioners were created by the Pennsylvania assembly in 1711 with a focus on taxation and held various regulatory powers throughout the centuries.

The commissioner started maintaining voter lists in 1799 and took on more election related responsibilities and didn't emerge into its current forum until the adoption of Philadelphia's Home Rule Charter in 1951. We will start off with public comments. Before beginning their comments, commenter

1 shall state where they live or if they are not a  
2 resident of Philadelphia, that they are a Philadelphia  
3 taxpayer. Public comment is not an opportunity for  
4 dialog or Q and A.

5 It is public comment, a chance for you to tell us  
6 what you think. Each speaker will have two minutes to  
7 speak, however, I may extend the time at my  
8 discretion. Public comment must concern matters on  
9 today's meeting agenda. Finally, it is my  
10 responsibility to preserve the order and decorum of  
11 the meetings as such. Profane, slanderous,  
12 discriminatory, personal attacks will not be  
13 tolerated.

14 If you wish to make a public objection to a  
15 perceived Sunshine violation, please raise your hand  
16 and I will recognize you. Outbursts will not be  
17 tolerated. Anyone wishing to offer public comment,  
18 please step forward. Hearing none. We will now move  
19 to email comments. Secretary Bluestein, are there any  
20 email public comments?

21 SECRETARY BLUESTEIN: There were no email public  
22 comments by 07:45 a.m.

23 CHAIRMAN SABIR: Thank you, Secretary. We will  
24 now proceed to new business. We will sign --

25 VICE-CHAIR DEELEY: Mr. Chairman.

1 CHAIRMAN SABIR: Yes. Yes.

2 VICE-CHAIR DEELEY: May I said I please be  
3 recognized for point of order?

4 CHAIRMAN SABIR: Yes, you may.

5 VICE-CHAIR DEELEY: I believe that the proper  
6 Sunshine notice was not given for today's meeting.  
7 Specifically, notice was not placed in the newspapers.  
8 The Sunshine Act states that an agency shall give  
9 public notice of each special meeting or each  
10 rescheduled regular or special meeting at least 24  
11 hours in advance of the time of the convening of the  
12 meeting specified in the notice.

13 The definition of public notice includes  
14 publication of notice of the place, date, and time of  
15 a meeting in a newspaper of general circulation as  
16 defined by 45 Pa. C.S. 101. The act states that  
17 should the court determine that the meeting did not  
18 meet the requirements of this chapter, it may, in its  
19 discretion, find that any or all official action taken  
20 at the meeting shall be invalid. It has consistently  
21 been the past advice of the law department that this  
22 had to be followed.

23 Even during a canvas. Furthermore, this notice  
24 is required by the public meeting rules. You were  
25 gracious enough to pass out last week at the board

1 meeting and were passed by this board on February 7<sup>th</sup> Page 6  
2 of this year. Thank you.

3 CHAIRMAN SABIR: So, Madam Vice-Chair, was that a  
4 motion? Are you making a motion that we canceled the  
5 meeting?

6 VICE-CHAIR DEELEY: Mr. Chairman, it is a  
7 perceived violation of the Sunshine Act.

8 CHAIRMAN SABIR: So, it's not a motion to cancel  
9 the meeting?

10 VICE-CHAIR DEELEY: It is not.

11 CHAIRMAN SABIR: Okay. Secretary Bluestein, you  
12 have any comments?

13 SECRETARY BLUESTEIN: I have none. Thank you.

14 CHAIRMAN SABIR: Sure. We will now proceed to  
15 new business. We will now sign the certification for  
16 September 17th, 2024 Special election.

17 (The meeting was recessed.)

18 CHAIRMAN SABIR: Can you just go on the record  
19 real quick and just say what you gave us? What we  
20 signed.

21 DEPUTY DIRECTOR ECKROADE: Good morning,  
22 Commissioners.

23 CHAIRMAN SABIR: Good morning.

24 DEPUTY DIRECTOR ECKROADE: Dana Eckroade, Deputy  
25 Executive Director, given you the certification

1 paperwork for you to sign. The 200 --

2 VICE-CHAIR DEELEY: Thank you.

3 DEPUTY DIRECTOR ECKROADE: -- or for the 195th  
4 and 201st districts.

5 CHAIRMAN SABIR: We will now move to any  
6 additional non-agenda items. Vice-Chair Deeley, do  
7 you have any other business to be raised at this  
8 meeting?

9 VICE-CHAIR DEELEY: I have none. Thank you.

10 CHAIRMAN SABIR: Secretary Bluestein, do you have  
11 any business to be raised at this meeting?

12 SECRETARY BLUESTEIN: I have none. Thank you.

13 CHAIRMAN SABIR: I'd like to say thank you,  
14 staff putting everything together. We got satellite  
15 offices opening up. We got special election. And we  
16 still have the most historic election in the history  
17 of our country that we still have to do. So, thank  
18 you for all your hard work. And since we don't have  
19 any other business, I move to adjourn this meeting of  
20 the Return Board. Is there a second?

21 VICE-CHAIR DEELEY: Second.

22 CHAIRMAN SABIR: Secretary Bluestein, please  
23 call the roll.

24 SECRETARY BLUESTEIN: Vice-Chair Deeley?

25 VICE-CHAIR DEELEY: I vote aye.

1           SECRETARY BLUESTEIN: I vote aye. Chairman

2 Sabir?

3           CHAIRMAN SABIR: Aye.

4           (The meeting was adjourned.)

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CERTIFICATE OF TRANSCRIPTIONIST

I, GRACE GITHUA, Legal Transcriptionist, do hereby certify:

That the foregoing is a complete and true transcription of the original digital audio recording of the testimony and proceedings captured in the above-entitled matter. As the transcriptionist, I have reviewed and transcribed the entirety of the original digital audio recording of the proceeding to ensure a verbatim record to the best of my ability.

I further certify that I am neither attorney for nor a relative or employee of any of the parties to the action; further, that I am not a relative or employee of any attorney employed by the parties hereto, nor financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS THEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 4th Day of October, 2024.



---

GRACE GITHUA

<hr/> 0	<hr/> 9	<b>Bluestein</b>	<b>Charter</b>	<b>county</b>
<b>07:45</b>	<b>9:00</b>	4:19,21	3:23	3:8
4:22	3:1	6:11,13	<b>circulation</b>	<b>court</b>
<hr/> 1	<hr/> A	<b>board</b>	5:15	5:17
<b>101</b>	<b>a.m.</b>	3:3,7 5:25	<b>city</b>	<b>created</b>
5:16	3:1 4:22	6:1	3:3,6,11,15	3:16
<b>1711</b>	<b>accordance</b>	<b>business</b>	<b>coincides</b>	<b>current</b>
3:17	3:14	4:24 6:15	3:10	3:21
<b>1799</b>	<b>act</b>	<hr/> C	<b>comment</b>	<hr/> D
3:20	3:5 5:8,16	<b>C.S.</b>	4:3,5,8,17	<b>Dana</b>
<b>17th</b>	6:7	5:16	<b>commenter</b>	6:24
6:16	<b>action</b>	<b>call</b>	3:24	<b>date</b>
<b>1951</b>	5:19	3:2	<b>comments</b>	5:14
3:23	<b>administer</b>	6:8	3:24 4:19,20,22 6:12	<b>decorum</b>
<hr/> 2	3:13	<b>canceled</b>	<b>commissioner</b>	4:10
<b>2024</b>	<b>adoption</b>	6:4	3:9,12,19	<b>DEELEY</b>
3:4 6:16	3:22	<b>canvas</b>	<b>commissioners</b>	4:25 5:2,5
<b>24</b>	<b>advance</b>	5:23	3:3,6,16	6:6,10
5:10	5:11	<b>centuries</b>	6:22	<b>defined</b>
<hr/> 3	<b>advice</b>	3:18	<b>compliance</b>	5:16
<b>30th</b>	5:21	<b>certification</b>	3:5	<b>definition</b>
3:4	<b>agency</b>	6:15,25	<b>concern</b>	5:13
<hr/> 4	5:8	<b>Chairman</b>	4:8	<b>department</b>
<b>45</b>	<b>agenda</b>	3:2 4:23,25 5:1,4	<b>conduct</b>	5:21
5:16	4:9	6:3,6,8,11,14,18,23	3:13	<b>departmental</b>
<hr/> 7	<b>assembly</b>	<b>chance</b>	<b>consistently</b>	3:12
<b>7th</b>	3:17	4:5	5:20	<b>Deputy</b>
6:1	<b>attacks</b>	<b>chapter</b>	<b>convening</b>	6:21,24
<hr/> A	4:12	5:18	5:11	<b>determine</b>
<b>beginning</b>	<hr/> B	<b>charge</b>	<b>council</b>	5:17
3:24	<b>beginning</b>	3:7	3:11	<b>dialog</b>
<b>bipartisan</b>	3:7			4:4
				<b>Director</b>

6:21,24,25	<b>focus</b>	<b>invalid</b>	<b>minutes</b>	5:3
<b>discretion</b>	3:17	5:20	4:6	<b>Outbursts</b>
4:8 5:19	<b>forum</b>	<hr/>	<b>Monday</b>	4:16
<b>discrimina</b>	3:22	<b>L</b>	3:4	<hr/>
<b>tory</b>	<b>forward</b>	<b>law</b>	<b>morning</b>	<b>P</b>
4:12	4:18	5:21	6:21,23	<b>Pa</b>
<hr/>	<b>four-year</b>	<b>laws</b>	<b>motion</b>	5:16
<b>E</b>	3:10	3:15	6:4,8	<b>pass</b>
<b>Eckroade</b>	<hr/>	<b>lists</b>	<b>move</b>	5:25
6:21,24	<b>G</b>	3:19	4:18	<b>passed</b>
<b>elected</b>	<b>gave</b>	<b>live</b>	<b>municipal</b>	6:1
3:7,9	6:19	4:1	3:10	<b>past</b>
<b>election</b>	<b>general</b>	<hr/>	<hr/>	5:21
3:11,15,20	5:15	<b>M</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>Pennsylvan</b>
6:16	<b>give</b>	<b>Madam</b>	<b>newspaper</b>	<b>ia</b>
<b>elections</b>	5:8	6:3	5:15	3:5,16
3:8,14	<b>Good</b>	<b>maintainin</b>	<b>newspapers</b>	<b>perceived</b>
<b>email</b>	6:21,23	<b>g</b>	5:7	4:15 6:7
4:19,20,21	<b>gracious</b>	3:19	<b>notice</b>	<b>personal</b>
<b>emerge</b>	5:25	<b>make</b>	5:6,7,9,	4:12
3:21	<hr/>	4:14	12,13,14,	<b>Philadelph</b>
<b>enforced</b>	<b>H</b>	<b>making</b>	23	<b>ia</b>
3:12	<b>hand</b>	6:4	<hr/>	3:3,6,9
<b>Executive</b>	4:15	<b>matters</b>	<b>O</b>	4:2
6:25	<b>Hearing</b>	4:8	<b>objection</b>	<b>Philadelph</b>
<b>extend</b>	4:18	<b>mayor</b>	4:14	<b>ia's</b>
4:7	<b>held</b>	3:11	<b>offer</b>	3:22
<hr/>	3:17	<b>meet</b>	4:17	<b>place</b>
<b>F</b>	<b>Home</b>	5:18	<b>official</b>	5:14
<b>February</b>	3:22	<b>meeting</b>	5:19	<b>point</b>
6:1	<b>hours</b>	3:2,4 4:9	<b>officials</b>	5:3
<b>federal</b>	5:11	5:6,9,10,	3:7	<b>policies</b>
3:14	<hr/>	12,15,17,	<b>opportunit</b>	3:13
<b>Finally</b>	<b>I</b>	20,24 6:1,	<b>y</b>	<b>powers</b>
4:9	<b>includes</b>	5,9,17	4:3	3:18
<b>find</b>	5:13	<b>meetings</b>	<b>order</b>	<b>preserve</b>
5:19		4:11	3:2 4:10	4:10

<b>proceed</b> 4:24 6:14	<b>regulatory</b> 3:18	<b>serve</b> 3:9	<b>taxpayer</b> 4:3
<b>Profane</b> 4:11	<b>related</b> 3:20	<b>set</b> 3:12	<b>term</b> 3:10
<b>proper</b> 5:5	<b>required</b> 5:24	<b>sign</b> 4:24 6:15	<b>three-member</b> 3:6
<b>public</b> 3:23 4:3, 5,8,14,17, 20,21 5:9, 13,24	<b>requiremen ts</b> 5:18	<b>signed</b> 6:20	<b>time</b> 4:7 5:11, 14
<b>publicatio n</b> 5:14	<b>reschedule d</b> 5:10	<b>slanderous</b> 4:11	<b>today's</b> 4:9 5:6
<hr/>	<b>resident</b> 4:2	<b>speak</b> 4:7	<b>tolerated</b> 4:13,17
<b>Q</b>	<b>responsibi lities</b> 3:21	<b>speaker</b> 4:6	<hr/>
<b>quick</b> 6:19	<b>responsibi lity</b> 4:10	<b>special</b> 5:9,10 6:16	<b>V</b>
<hr/>	<b>Return</b> 3:3	<b>Specificical ly</b> 5:7	<b>Vice-chair</b> 4:25 5:2,5 6:3,6,10
<b>R</b>	<b>Rule</b> 3:22	<b>start</b> 3:23	<b>violation</b> 4:15 6:7
<b>raise</b> 4:15	<b>rules</b> 5:24	<b>started</b> 3:19	<b>voter</b> 3:8,13,14, 19
<b>real</b> 6:19	<hr/>	<b>state</b> 3:14 4:1	<hr/>
<b>recessed</b> 6:17	<b>S</b>	<b>states</b> 5:8,16	<b>W</b>
<b>recognize</b> 4:16	<b>SABIR</b> 3:2 4:23	<b>step</b> 4:18	<b>week</b> 5:25
<b>recognized</b> 5:3	5:1,4 6:3, 8,11,14, 18,23	<b>Sunshine</b> 3:5 4:15 5:6,8 6:7	<b>wishing</b> 4:17
<b>record</b> 6:18	<b>Secretary</b> 4:19,21,23 6:11,13	<hr/>	<hr/>
<b>registrati on</b> 3:8,13,15	<b>September</b> 3:4 6:16	<b>T</b>	<b>Y</b>
<b>regular</b> 5:10		<b>taxation</b> 3:17	<b>year</b> 6:2



**Public Meeting Agenda: Return Board Meeting**  
September 30, 2024 – 9:00 A.M.

Philadelphia City Commissioners  
11311 Roosevelt Blvd.  
Philadelphia, PA 19154

- I. Call to Order
  
- II. Public Comment
  - A. In-Person Public Comments
  - B. Report from the Secretary – Emailed Public Comment
  
- III. New Business
  - A. Signing of Certification
  - B. Additional Non-Agenda Items