

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PHILADELPHIA CITY COMMISSIONERS

PHILADELPHIA CITY COMMISSIONERS RETURN BOARD MEETING

Tuesday, September 24, 2024

5:00 p.m.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

ATTENDANCE

OMAR SABIR, CHAIRMAN
KHALIF CHESTNUT, SIT-IN FOR DEPUTY TO THE CHAIR,
VINCENT GOWANS
LISA DEELEY, VICE-CHAIR
NICHOLAS CUSTODIO, DEPUTY TO VICE-CHAIR
SETH BLUESTEIN, COMMISSIONER
ERIC KAPENSTEIN, DEPUTY COMMISSIONER
JOSEPH LYNCH, DIRECTOR OF OPERATIONS
STEPHANIE REED, DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATIONS
DANA ECKROADE, DEPUTY DIRECTOR OF COMPLIANCE

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 (5:00 p.m.)

3 THE CHAIR: Good evening. I call to order the
4 meeting of the Philadelphia Commissioners Return Board
5 for Tuesday, September 24th, 2024. This meeting is in
6 compliance with the Pennsylvania Sunshine Act.

7 The Philadelphia City Commissioners are a three-
8 member bipartisan board of elected officials in charge
9 of elections and voter registration for the City of
10 Philadelphia.

11 Each commissioner is elected to serve a four-year
12 term that coincides with the municipal election cycle
13 for mayor and city council. The commissioners set and
14 enforce departmental policies to administer voter
15 registration and conduct elections in accordance with
16 federal and state voter registration and election
17 laws.

18 The city commissioners were created by the
19 Pennsylvania Assembly in 1711 with a focus on taxation
20 and held various regulatory powers throughout the
21 centuries. The commissioners started maintaining
22 voter lists in 1799 and took on more election related
23 responsibilities but didn't emerge into its current
24 form until the adoption of Philadelphia Home Rule
25 Charter in 1951.

1 We will start off with public comments. Before
2 beginning their comments, commenters shall state where
3 they live or if they are not a resident of
4 Philadelphia, that they are a Philadelphia taxpayer.
5 Public comment is not an opportunity for dialogue or
6 Q&A. It is public comment, a chance for you to tell
7 us what you think.

8 MS. DEELEY: Mr. Chairman, point of order,
9 please.

10 THE CHAIR: You have to wait and then we'll get
11 into it. Hold tight. Each speaker will have two
12 minutes to speak. However, I may extend the time at
13 my discretion. Public comment must concern matters on
14 today's meeting agenda.

15 Finally, it is my responsibility to preserve the
16 order and decorum of the meetings. As such, profane
17 slanders, discriminatory or personal attacks will not
18 be tolerated. If you wish to make a public objection
19 to a perceived Sunshine violation, please raise your
20 hand and I will recognize you. Outbursts will not be
21 tolerated. Anyone wishing to offer public comment,
22 please step forward.

23 MS. DEELEY: Mr. Chairman, point of order,
24 please.

25 THE CHAIR: Madam Vice-Chair, I heard you. We're

1 in a public comment part of our meeting. If there's
2 no public commenters, we will now move to report from
3 secretary for email public comments. Commissioner
4 Bluestein, are there any email public comments?

5 MR. BLUESTEIN: There were no email public
6 comments by 3:45 p.m.

7 THE CHAIR: We will now proceed to new business.
8 We will begin by considering the first agenda item
9 under new business, "Mail ballot sufficiency
10 determinations." We will call up deputy executive
11 director compliance, vote by mail. Good evening,
12 Dana.

13 MS. DEELEY: Mr. Chairman, I would just like to
14 make an objection, as I do have a point of order.
15 Anyone making a Sunshine Act violation may make an
16 objection at any time.

17 THE CHAIR: Well, first of all, okay. You have
18 to be recognized. It's up to my discretion of decorum
19 of the meeting. So we were going to get to that
20 point. So, you know, if it will please you, like I
21 said, before Dana gets done doing whatever she's
22 doing, then we move on to when we have comments, then
23 you can raise that issue.

24 Would you like to wait till the other business
25 portion or does it have to be right this second?

1 MS. DEELEY: It has to be right this second, Mr.
2 Chairman. If I may?

3 THE CHAIR: Yes, you may.

4 MS. DEELEY: I believe that the proper Sunshine
5 notice was not given for Saturday's and tonight's
6 meeting. Specifically, notice was not placed in the
7 newspapers. The Sunshine Act states that an agency
8 shall give public notice of each special meeting or
9 each rescheduled regular or special meeting at least
10 24 hours in advance of the time of the convening of
11 the meeting specified in the notice.

12 The definition of public notice includes
13 publication of notice of the place, date, and time of
14 a meeting in a newspaper of general circulation as
15 defined by 45 Pa. C.S. Â§ 101. The Act states that
16 should the court determine that the meeting did not
17 meet the requirements of this chapter, it may, in its
18 discretion, find that any or all official action taken
19 at the meeting shall be invalid.

20 This is concerning given the votes that occurred
21 on Saturday and those scheduled for tonight. I
22 believe that we are unable to hold tonight's meeting.

23 THE CHAIR: It's okay. So are you making a
24 motion?

25 MS. DEELEY: I'm saying that I don't believe that

1 we can have this meeting because it wasn't publicly,
2 publicly noticed.

3 THE CHAIR: Okay. It's on the record. I'd like
4 to move forward.

5 MR. BLUESTEIN: Mr. Chairman, may I comment
6 before we move forward?

7 THE CHAIR: Sure.

8 MR. BLUESTEIN: The opening of the Return Board
9 and the official canvas was properly noticed in the
10 newspapers. The meeting was never adjourned and each
11 of these sessions has been noticed with 24 hours
12 advance notice on our website. Thank you.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

14 MS. DEELEY: I don't believe that to be true,
15 but.

16 THE CHAIR: Okay. Are we finished? Can we move
17 forward? Or we just want to sit back and go back and
18 forth for all day? Because I'll wait. Anything else
19 you want to say?

20 MS. DEELEY: No. I'll, I'll -- I'm fine.

21 THE CHAIR: Are you sure?

22 MS. DEELEY: Yeah.

23 THE CHAIR: Okay. So good evening, Dana. You
24 want to just say your name again for the record and
25 your title?

1 MS. ECKROADE: Dana Eckroade, deputy director for
2 compliance and mail-in ballot.

3 THE CHAIR: Sure. Can you please read the first
4 category and number of votes?

5 MS. ECKROADE: Okay. So mail-in ballot
6 sufficiency determination. Number 1, "ID verification
7 - no Social Security or driver's license on SURE
8 file." We have one ballot.

9 THE CHAIR: I move that this board accepts
10 ballots with no Social Security or driver's license on
11 the SURE file. Is there a second?

12 MS. DEELEY: Second.

13 THE CHAIR: Commissioners, do you have any
14 comments?

15 MS. DEELEY: None.

16 THE CHAIR: Okay. Secretary Bluestein, please
17 call the roll.

18 MR. BLUESTEIN: Mr. Chairman, before we vote, I
19 would just put on the record that I do not believe we
20 can count ballots that have not had their IDs
21 verified, unless the voter is eligible for an
22 alternative ballot. So overall, this category should
23 be broken out by age of the individual voters before
24 making a determination. Thank you, sir.

25 THE CHAIR: Sure. But just as a matter of rule,

1 when I say if anyone has a comment, please make the
2 comment at that point. Secretary Bluestein, please
3 call the roll.

4 MR. BLUESTEIN: Vice-Chair Deeley?

5 MS. DEELEY: Aye.

6 MR. BLUESTEIN: I vote nay. Chairman Sabir?

7 THE CHAIR: Aye. Motion passed. We will now
8 move to the next category.

9 MS. ECKROADE: "ID verification - ID opposite of
10 what is on SURE file." We have one ballot.

11 THE CHAIR: I move that this board accepts
12 ballots with an ID provided, opposite of what is on
13 the SURE file. Is there a second?

14 MS. DEELEY: Second.

15 THE CHAIR: Does anyone have any comments before
16 we proceed to vote? Secretary Bluestein?

17 MR. BLUESTEIN: No, Mr. Chair. Thank you.

18 THE CHAIR: Please call the roll.

19 MR. BLUESTEIN: Vice-Chair Deeley?

20 MS. DEELEY: I vote aye.

21 MR. BLUESTEIN: I vote nay. Chairman Sabir?

22 THE CHAIR: Aye. Motion passed. We will move to
23 the next category.

24 MS. ECKROADE: "ID verification - no response."
25 We have zero.

1 THE CHAIR: Okay.

2 MS. ECKROADE: Oh, wait. I'm sorry. ID -- I'm
3 so sorry.

4 THE CHAIR: Take your time.

5 MS. ECKROADE: "ID verification - no response,"
6 we have 32. My apologies.

7 THE CHAIR: Okay. Take your time. All right. I
8 move that this board does not accept ballots where the
9 voter did not respond to the request from the County
10 Board of Elections for ID verification. Is there a
11 second?

12 MS. DEELEY: Second.

13 THE CHAIR: Does any commissioner have any
14 comments before we proceed to vote?

15 MS. DEELEY: I have none.

16 MR. BLUESTEIN: I have none.

17 THE CHAIR: Secretary Bluestein, please call the
18 roll.

19 MR. BLUESTEIN: Vice-Chair Deeley?

20 MS. DEELEY: I vote aye.

21 MR. BLUESTEIN: I vote aye. Chairman Sabir?

22 THE CHAIR: Aye. Motion passed. We will now
23 move to the final category.

24 MS. ECKROADE: So, "ID verification - ID doesn't
25 match SURE file." We have zero ballots.

1 THE CHAIR: Okay. No ballots in this category.
2 That brings us to the end of our mail ballot
3 sufficiency determination. Thank you so much for all
4 your work this election, Dana.

5 MS. ECKROADE: Thank you.

6 THE CHAIR: The board will now take a brief
7 recess to update the results of our computation to
8 reflect these votes.

9 MS. DEELEY: Mr. Chairman, I would like to make a
10 motion that we table this reading of the results to
11 allow for the two-day appeal deadline for the votes
12 that we took tonight. We have always, along the
13 advice of the law department, built in those two days
14 for the appeals.

15 THE CHAIR: So are you making a motion?

16 MS. DEELEY: Yes, sir.

17 THE CHAIR: Is there a second? There's no
18 second.

19 (Recess.)

20 THE CHAIR: I now call the meeting back to order.
21 We will move to the second item of new business on our
22 agenda, "Results of the canvas and computation."
23 Dana, will you please read the results?

24 MS. ECKROADE: Hello, Commissioners.

25 THE CHAIR: Hello, Dana.

1 MS. ECKROADE: I'm going to start with
2 Representative in the General assembly for the 195th
3 District. Keith S. Harris, Democrat, had 3162 votes.
4 Write-in totals, he had 135. Representative in the
5 General Assembly for the 201st District. Andre D.
6 Carroll, Democrat, had 3205 votes. Write-in totals
7 59. And that is all.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Dana.

9 MS. ECKROADE: You're welcome.

10 THE CHAIR: We will now move to any additional
11 non-agenda items. Vice-Chair Deeley, do you have any
12 other business to be raised at this meeting?

13 MS. DEELEY: I have none.

14 THE CHAIR: Secretary Bluestein, do you have any
15 other business to be raised at this meeting?

16 MR. BLUESTEIN: I have none. Thank you.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Commissioners. I have one
18 small non-agenda item. I would like to congratulate
19 Philadelphia Phillies for winning the National League
20 East Championship. Hopefully they bring home a World
21 Series to our cities. Now, no more items remain on
22 tonight's agenda. Thank you.

23 (The meeting was adjourned.)

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE OF TRANSCRIPTIONIST

I, GEOFFREY NJAGI, Legal Transcriptionist, do hereby certify:

That the foregoing is a complete and true transcription of the original digital audio recording of the testimony and proceedings captured in the above-entitled matter. As the transcriptionist, I have reviewed and transcribed the entirety of the original digital audio recording of the proceeding to ensure a verbatim record to the best of my ability.

I further certify that I am neither attorney for nor a relative or employee of any of the parties to the action; further, that I am not a relative or employee of any attorney employed by the parties hereto, nor financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS THEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 7th day of October, 2024.



Geoffrey Njagi

1	action 6:18	C	21 5:1 7:5	6:13
101 6:15	adjourned 7:10	C.S. 6:15	commenters 4:2 5:2	day 7:18
1711 3:19	administer 3:14	call 3:3 5:10	comments 4:1,2 5:3, 4,6,22	decorum 4:16 5:18
1799 3:22	adoption 3:24	canvas 7:9	commissioner 3:11 5:3	DEELEY 4:8,23 5:13 6:1, 4,25 7:14, 20,22
1951 3:25	advance 6:10 7:12	centuries 3:21	commissioners 3:4,7,13, 18,21	defined 6:15
2	agency 6:7	CHAIR 3:3 4:10, 25 5:7,17 6:3,23 7:3,7,13, 16,21,23	compliance 3:6 5:11	definition 6:12
2024 3:5	agenda 4:14 5:8	Chairman 4:8,23 5:13 6:2 7:5	concern 4:13	departmental 3:14
24 6:10 7:11	Assembly 3:19	chance 4:6	conduct 3:15	deputy 5:10
24th 3:5	attacks 4:17	chapter 6:17	convening 6:10	determinations 5:10
3	B	charge 3:8	council 3:13	determine 6:16
3:45 5:6	back 7:17	Charter 3:25	court 6:16	dialogue 4:5
4	ballot 5:9	circulation 6:14	created 3:18	director 5:11
45 6:15	begin 5:8	city 3:7,9,13, 18	current 3:23	discretion 4:13 5:18 6:18
5	beginning 4:2	coincides 3:12	D	discriminatory 4:17
5:00 3:2	bipartisan 3:8	comment 4:5,6,13,	Dana 5:12,21 7:23	E
A	Bluestein 5:4,5 7:5, 8		date	elected 3:8,11
accordance 3:15	board 3:4,8 7:8			
Act 3:6 5:15 6:7,15	business 5:7,9,24			

election 3:12,16,22	3:11		member 3:8	7:8
elections 3:9,15	G	L	minutes 4:12	opportunit y 4:5
email 5:3,4,5	general 6:14	laws 3:17	motion 6:24	order 3:3 4:8, 16,23 5:14
emerge 3:23	give 6:8	lists 3:22	move 5:2,22 7:4,6,16	Outbursts 4:20
enforce 3:14	good 3:3 5:11 7:23	live 4:3	municipal 3:12	P
evening 3:3 5:11 7:23	H	Madam 4:25	N	p.m. 3:2 5:6
executive 5:10	hand 4:20	mail 5:9,11	newspaper 6:14	Pa 6:15
extend 4:12	heard 4:25	maintainin g 3:21	newspapers 6:7 7:10	part 5:1
F	held 3:20	make 4:18 5:14, 15	notice 6:5,6,8, 11,12,13 7:12	Pennsylvan ia 3:6,19
federal 3:16	hold 4:11 6:22	making 5:15 6:23	noticed 7:2,9,11	perceived 4:19
Finally 4:15	Home 3:24	matters 4:13	O	personal 4:17
find 6:18	hours 6:10 7:11	mayor 3:13	objection 4:18 5:14, 16	Philadelph ia 3:4,7,10, 24 4:4
fine 7:20	I	meet 6:17	occurred 6:20	place 6:13
finished 7:16	includes 6:12	meeting 3:4,5 4:14 5:1,19 6:6,8,9, 11,14,16, 19,22 7:1, 10	offer 4:21	point 4:8,23 5:14,20
focus 3:19	invalid 6:19	meetings 4:16	official 6:18 7:9	policies 3:14
form 3:24	issue 5:23		officials 3:8	portion 5:25
forward 4:22 7:4, 6,17	item 5:8		opening	
four-year				

powers 3:20	registrati on 3:9,15,16	secretary 5:3	3:6 4:19 5:15 6:4,7	<hr/> V
preserve 4:15	regular 6:9	September 3:5	<hr/> T	Vice-chair 4:25
proceed 5:7	regulatory 3:20	serve 3:11	taxation 3:19	violation 4:19 5:15
profane 4:16	related 3:22	sessions 7:11	taxpayer 4:4	vote 5:11
proper 6:4	report 5:2	set 3:13	term 3:12	voter 3:9,14,16, 22
properly 7:9	requiremen ts 6:17	sit 7:17	three- 3:7	votes 6:20
public 4:1,5,6, 13,18,21 5:1,2,3,4, 5 6:8,12	reschedule d 6:9	slanders 4:17	tight 4:11	<hr/> W
publicatio n 6:13	resident 4:3	speak 4:12	till 5:24	wait 4:10 5:24 7:18
publicly 7:1,2	responsibi lities 3:23	speaker 4:11	time 4:12 5:16 6:10,13	website 7:12
<hr/> Q	responsibi lity 4:15	special 6:8,9	title 7:25	wishing 4:21
Q&a 4:6	Return 3:4 7:8	Specifically 6:6	today's 4:14	
<hr/> R	Rule 3:24	start 4:1	tolerated 4:18,21	
raise 4:19 5:23	<hr/> S	started 3:21	tonight 6:21	
recognize 4:20	Saturday 6:21	state 3:16 4:2	tonight's 6:5,22	
recognized 5:18	Saturday's 6:5	states 6:7,15	true 7:14	
record 7:3,24	scheduled 6:21	step 4:22	Tuesday 3:5	
		sufficienc y 5:9	<hr/> U	
		Sunshine	unable 6:22	



Philadelphia
City Commissioners

September 24, 2024

5:00pm

Philadelphia City Commissioners

11311 Roosevelt Blvd

Philadelphia, PA 19154

- I. Call to order the Return Board meeting of Tuesday, September 24, 2024
- II. Public Comment
 - a. In-Person Public Comments
 - b. Report from the Secretary – Emailed Public Comment
- III. New Business
 - A. Mail Ballot Sufficiency Determination
 1. ID verification - no social security or driver's license on SURE file
 2. ID verification - ID provided opposite of what is on SURE file
 3. ID verification - no response
 4. ID verification - ID doesn't match SURE file
 - B. Results of the Canvassing and Computation
 - C. Additional non-Agenda items