

1                   JUDGE CRUMLISH: I'm Judge  
2 James Crumlish and I am sitting as Chair of  
3 the Return Board. With me today also is  
4 Judge Furlong and Judge Johnson.

5                   Good afternoon, all. So, first of  
6 all, I will remind all that it is my duty  
7 and obligation to preserve order and decorum  
8 in these meetings. Everyone in attendance  
9 should be on notice that shouting or  
10 disruptive conduct won't be tolerated.  
11 Those who violate this rule may be asked to  
12 leave.

13                   The Sunshine Act permits anyone  
14 attending a public meeting to object to a  
15 perceived violation at any time during the  
16 meeting. If you choose to do so, please  
17 succinctly state your objection and I'll  
18 remind you that an objection is not an  
19 opportunity for litigation or speechmaking.

20                   Next, we will now move to public  
21 comment. Commentors shall state where they  
22 live or if they're not a resident of  
23 Philadelphia that they are a Philadelphia  
24 taxpayer or since this is the Return Board

1 which candidate, if any, they represent.

2 Public comments are not an  
3 opportunity to engage in a dialogue or  
4 questions and answers with the Board. It is  
5 public comment. It is a chance for you to  
6 tell us what you think. Each speaker shall  
7 have approximately two minutes. However, I  
8 may in my discretion extend that time. All  
9 public comments must be relevant or germane  
10 to the Board and the Board business.

11 Finally, it is my responsibility  
12 to preserve such order and decorum in these  
13 meetings. And as such, profane, slanderous,  
14 discriminatory, or ad hominem, that is  
15 personal attacks, won't be tolerated.  
16 Anyone wishing to offer a public comment may  
17 please step forward.

18 MR. GARELLA: Good afternoon.  
19 On behalf -- my name is Rich Garella. On  
20 behalf of Protect Our Vote Philly, I note  
21 and object to the serious violations of the  
22 Pennsylvania Sunshine Act that took place at  
23 this Board's May 26th meeting.

24 In particular, in the course of

1 considering whether to accept provisional  
2 ballots in a category named chain of custody  
3 issue, members of this Board conversed among  
4 themselves about the official business at  
5 hand. This discussion was mostly inaudible  
6 to the public as the members withdrew from  
7 the microphones and spoke quietly.

8 For the record, portions of that  
9 conversation included Secretary Furlong  
10 asking, Yeah, what is that, chain of  
11 custody? And is this where they left it in  
12 the trunk of the ward leader's car? And  
13 mentioning the River Wards.

14 Chair Crumlish participated but  
15 his responses are inaudible except when he  
16 says, True story. There's more but if any  
17 of these quotations are not accurate, I  
18 invite you to correct them now so that they  
19 appear accurately on the transcript.

20 This Board violated the Sunshine  
21 Act by deliberating out of hearing of the  
22 public at a supposedly open meeting. In  
23 addition, it withheld from the public the  
24 number of votes being considered; the

1 division, the division for wards where their  
2 chain of custody issue supposedly took place  
3 and the nature of the issues. The public  
4 was left with no way to understand what was  
5 being voted on or what the basis of the  
6 Board's decision was.

7 Candidates were left with no way  
8 to know if the issues may have impacted  
9 their results or if these provisional  
10 ballots were even present during the  
11 election code mandated observation period,  
12 that is whether election code was also  
13 violated.

14 These are serious violations that  
15 undermine trust and the integrity of our  
16 elections along with the very evident lack  
17 of documented chain of custody procedures.  
18 We urge the Board to explain now exactly  
19 what happened and to create actual chain of  
20 custody protections that are documented for  
21 the public. Thank you.

22 JUDGE CRUMLISH: Thank you.

23 Judge Furlong, do we have any public  
24 comments that have been e-mailed?

1 JUDGE FURLONG: Thank you,  
2 Mr. Chairman. Judge Crumlish, as of 9:45  
3 a.m., the City Commissioners Office received  
4 no public comments via e-mail.

5 JUDGE CRUMLISH: Thank you  
6 very much, Judge Furlong. Having said that,  
7 we'll now move to new business which is the  
8 category signing of the certification for  
9 the 2023 primary election.

10 The record will reflect that Judge  
11 Johnson, Judge Furlong, and myself have  
12 executed the Certificate of Elections for  
13 the primary election of 2023. Judge  
14 Furlong, do we have any additional agenda  
15 items?

16 JUDGE FURLONG: No, your  
17 Honor.

18 JUDGE CRUMLISH: Judge  
19 Johnson, do we have any additional agenda  
20 items?

21 JUDGE JOHNSON: No, Mr.  
22 Chairman.

23 JUDGE CRUMLISH: We will  
24 stand in recess until the call of the Chair.

1 The conduct of this meeting has concluded.

2 - - -

3 (This concludes the meeting.)

4 - - -

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, hereby certify that the proceedings and evidence noted are contained fully and accurately in the stenographic notes taken by me in the foregoing matter, and that this is a correct transcript of the same.

*Amy Margaris*

Court Reporter - Notary Public

(The foregoing certification of this transcript does not apply to any reproduction of the same by any means, unless under the direct control and/or supervision of the certifying reporter.)

<hr/> <p>2</p> <p>2023</p> <p>5:9,13</p> <p>26th</p> <p>2:23</p> <hr/> <p>9</p> <p>9:45</p> <p>5:2</p> <hr/> <p>A</p> <p>a.m.</p> <p>5:3</p> <p>accept</p> <p>3:1</p> <p>accurate</p> <p>3:17</p> <p>accurately</p> <p>3:19</p> <p>Act</p> <p>2:22 3:21</p> <p>actual</p> <p>4:19</p> <p>ad</p> <p>2:14</p> <p>addition</p> <p>3:23</p> <p>additional</p> <p>5:14,19</p> <p>afternoon</p> <p>2:18</p> <p>agenda</p> <p>5:14,19</p> <p>answers</p> <p>2:4</p>	<p>approximately</p> <p>2:7</p> <p>attacks</p> <p>2:15</p> <hr/> <p>B</p> <p>ballots</p> <p>3:2 4:10</p> <p>basis</p> <p>4:5</p> <p>behalf</p> <p>2:19,20</p> <p>Board</p> <p>2:4,10</p> <p>3:3,20</p> <p>4:18</p> <p>Board's</p> <p>2:23 4:6</p> <p>business</p> <p>2:10 3:4</p> <p>5:7</p> <hr/> <p>C</p> <p>call</p> <p>5:24</p> <p>candidate</p> <p>2:1</p> <p>Candidates</p> <p>4:7</p> <p>car</p> <p>3:12</p> <p>category</p> <p>3:2 5:8</p> <p>Certificate</p> <p>5:12</p>	<p>certificati on</p> <p>5:8</p> <p>chain</p> <p>3:2,10</p> <p>4:2,17,19</p> <p>Chair</p> <p>3:14 5:24</p> <p>Chairman</p> <p>5:2,22</p> <p>chance</p> <p>2:5</p> <p>City</p> <p>5:3</p> <p>code</p> <p>4:11,12</p> <p>comment</p> <p>2:5,16</p> <p>comments</p> <p>2:2,9 4:24</p> <p>5:4</p> <p>Commissione rs</p> <p>5:3</p> <p>considered</p> <p>3:24</p> <p>conversatio n</p> <p>3:9</p> <p>conversed</p> <p>3:3</p> <p>correct</p> <p>3:18</p> <p>create</p> <p>4:19</p> <p>Crumlish</p> <p>3:14 4:22</p> <p>5:2,5,18,</p>	<p>23</p> <p>custody</p> <p>3:2,11</p> <p>4:2,17,20</p> <hr/> <p>D</p> <p>decision</p> <p>4:6</p> <p>decorum</p> <p>2:12</p> <p>deliberatin g</p> <p>3:21</p> <p>dialogue</p> <p>2:3</p> <p>discretion</p> <p>2:8</p> <p>discriminat ory</p> <p>2:14</p> <p>discussion</p> <p>3:5</p> <p>division</p> <p>4:1</p> <p>documented</p> <p>4:17,20</p> <hr/> <p>E</p> <p>e-mail</p> <p>5:4</p> <p>e-mailed</p> <p>4:24</p> <p>election</p> <p>4:11,12</p> <p>5:9,13</p> <p>elections</p> <p>4:16 5:12</p>	<p>engage</p> <p>2:3</p> <p>evident</p> <p>4:16</p> <p>executed</p> <p>5:12</p> <p>explain</p> <p>4:18</p> <p>extend</p> <p>2:8</p> <hr/> <p>F</p> <p>Finally</p> <p>2:11</p> <p>forward</p> <p>2:17</p> <p>Furlong</p> <p>3:9 4:23</p> <p>5:1,6,11,</p> <p>14,16</p> <hr/> <p>G</p> <p>Garella</p> <p>2:18,19</p> <p>germane</p> <p>2:9</p> <p>Good</p> <p>2:18</p> <hr/> <p>H</p> <p>hand</p> <p>3:5</p> <p>happened</p> <p>4:19</p> <p>hearing</p> <p>3:21</p> <p>hominem</p>
--	---	---	--	--



2:14	<b>left</b>	2:16	<b>profane</b>	<b>responsibil</b>
<b>Honor</b>	3:11 4:4,7	<b>Office</b>	2:13	<b>ity</b>
5:17	_____	5:3	<b>Protect</b>	2:11
	<b>M</b>	<b>official</b>	2:20	<b>results</b>
<b>I</b>	<b>mandated</b>	3:4	<b>protections</b>	4:9
<b>impacted</b>	4:11	<b>open</b>	4:20	<b>Rich</b>
4:8	<b>meeting</b>	3:22	<b>provisional</b>	2:19
<b>inaudible</b>	2:23 3:22	<b>opportunity</b>	3:1 4:9	<b>River</b>
3:5,15	<b>meetings</b>	2:3	<b>public</b>	3:13
<b>included</b>	2:13	<b>order</b>	2:2,5,9,16	_____
3:9	<b>members</b>	2:12	3:6,22,23	<b>S</b>
<b>integrity</b>	3:3,6		4:3,21,23	<b>Secretary</b>
4:15	<b>mentioning</b>	<b>P</b>	5:4	3:9
<b>invite</b>	3:13	<b>participate</b>		<b>signing</b>
3:18	<b>microphones</b>	<b>d</b>	<b>Q</b>	5:8
<b>issue</b>	3:7	3:14	<b>questions</b>	<b>slanderous</b>
3:3 4:2	<b>minutes</b>	<b>Pennsylvania</b>	2:4	2:13
<b>issues</b>	2:7	<b>a</b>	<b>quietly</b>	<b>speaker</b>
4:3,8	<b>move</b>	2:22	3:7	2:6
<b>items</b>	5:7	<b>period</b>	<b>quotations</b>	<b>spoke</b>
5:15,20	_____	4:11	3:17	3:7
	<b>N</b>	<b>personal</b>		<b>stand</b>
<b>J</b>	<b>named</b>	2:15	<b>R</b>	5:24
<b>Johnson</b>	3:2	<b>Philly</b>	<b>received</b>	<b>step</b>
5:11,19,21	<b>nature</b>	2:20	5:3	2:17
<b>Judge</b>	4:3	<b>place</b>	<b>recess</b>	<b>story</b>
4:22,23	<b>note</b>	2:22 4:2	5:24	3:16
5:1,2,5,6,	2:20	<b>portions</b>	<b>record</b>	<b>Sunshine</b>
10,11,13,	<b>number</b>	3:8	3:8 5:10	2:22 3:20
16,18,21,	3:24	<b>present</b>	<b>reflect</b>	<b>supposedly</b>
23	_____	4:10	5:10	3:22 4:2
	<b>O</b>	<b>preserve</b>	<b>relevant</b>	_____
<b>L</b>	<b>object</b>	2:12	2:9	<b>T</b>
<b>lack</b>	2:21	<b>primary</b>	<b>represent</b>	<b>time</b>
4:16	<b>observation</b>	5:9,13	2:1	2:8
<b>leader's</b>	4:11	<b>procedures</b>	<b>responses</b>	<b>tolerated</b>
3:12	<b>offer</b>	4:17	3:15	2:15

<b>transcript</b>	3:6	
3:19	<b>withheld</b>	
<b>True</b>	3:23	
3:16		
<b>trunk</b>		
3:12		
<b>trust</b>		
4:15		
<hr/>		
<b>U</b>		
<b>undermine</b>		
4:15		
<b>understand</b>		
4:4		
<b>urge</b>		
4:18		
<hr/>		
<b>V</b>		
<b>violated</b>		
3:20 4:13		
<b>violations</b>		
2:21 4:14		
<b>Vote</b>		
2:20		
<b>voted</b>		
4:5		
<b>votes</b>		
3:24		
<hr/>		
<b>W</b>		
<b>ward</b>		
3:12		
<b>wards</b>		
3:13 4:1		
<b>wishing</b>		
2:16		
<b>withdrew</b>		