

1 PHILADELPHIA CITY COMMISSIONERS

2 BOARD OF ELECTION

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11 ELECTIONS MEETING

12

13 Wednesday, January 31st, 2024

14 11:00 a.m.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

ATTENDANCE

- OMAR SABIR, CHAIRMAN
- SEITH BLUESTEIN, COMMISSIONER
- LISA DEELEY, COMMISSIONER
- STEPHANIE REID, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
- BRIAN MIRACLE, BUDGET DIRECTOR
- JOSEPH LYNCH, DIRECTOR OF ELECTIONS OPERATIONS
- MR. CAPSTEIN, COMMITTEE MEMBER, LANGUAGE ACCESS COMMITTEE

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 (11:00 a.m.)

3 CHAIR SABIR: Good morning. I call to order the
4 meeting of Philadelphia City Commissioners Board of
5 Election for Wednesday, January 31st, 2024. We will
6 start off with public comments. Commentators shall
7 state where they live or if they are not a resident of
8 Philadelphia, but they are a Philadelphia taxpayer.
9 Public comment is not an opportunity for dialogue or
10 Q&A. It is a public comment, a chance for you to tell
11 us what you think. Each speaker will have two
12 minutes. However, I may extend that time at my
13 discretion.

14 All public comments must be relevant or germane
15 to board business. Finally, it is my responsibility
16 to preserve the order and decorum of the meetings as
17 such profane, slanderous, discriminatory, or personal
18 attacks will not be tolerated. Anyone wishing
19 offering -- to offer a public comment, please step
20 forward.

21 MR. GARELLA: Good morning.

22 CHAIR SABIR: Good morning.

23 MR. GARELLA: Good morning, commissioners, and
24 congratulations to those who have been elected to new
25 positions on the board.

1 CHAIR SABIR: Will you please state your name for
2 the record?

3 MR. GARELLA: My name is Rich Garella and I'm
4 speaking on behalf of Protect Our Vote Philly, and I'm
5 a resident of South Philly. In the Pennsylvania
6 Sunshine act, the General assembly said that the right
7 of the public to be present at all meetings of the
8 agencies and to witness the deliberation, policy
9 formulation and decision making of agencies is vital
10 to the enhancement and proper functioning of the
11 democratic process.

12 But for the last four years, we've been watching
13 as this board turned into perhaps the most opaque and
14 secretive agency in Philadelphia. Instead of making
15 its decisions, where meetings follow a pre-written
16 scripts and votes were decided beforehand. Where the
17 board held unexplained executive sessions at will and
18 where board members were even forbidden from speaking
19 to the public at these open meetings, even to answer
20 the simplest of questions. That's not the way it
21 should be and that's not the way the law says it
22 should be. Under the new rules passed three weeks
23 ago, some of the powers given to the chair four years
24 ago have been given back to the body as a whole. That
25 is important for transparency and accountability. The

1 question remains, though, is this change going to be
2 reflected in a new relationship with the public? The
3 public that you serve has so much to offer. Are we
4 going to see a real effort to open the doors and let
5 the sun shine in? We have plenty of recommendations
6 and suggestions and we stand ready to help you open
7 those doors in a spirit of cooperation, as does the
8 whole voting public of Philadelphia. So, Mr. Chair,
9 Commissioner Sabir, is this board ready? Are you
10 ready to work together with the public for the
11 fairest, most accessible, most secure elections
12 Philadelphia has ever had?

13 CHAIR SABIR: Does that conclude your comment?

14 MR. GARELLA: It could. Are you willing to do
15 that?

16 CHAIR SABIR: It's not a Q&A. Does that conclude
17 your comment?

18 MR. GARELLA: Well, I'm just asking a simple
19 question.

20 CHAIR SABIR: Thank you.

21 MR. GARELLA: I have copies of our
22 recommendations for better Sunshine meetings here.

23 CHAIR SABIR: Thank you.

24 MR. GARELLA: Would you care to distribute that?

25 CHAIR BLUESTEIN: You can hold it to the end of

1 the meeting. Thank you.

2 CHAIR SABIR: Thank you, Rich. Is there anyone
3 else that has a public comment? We will move to a
4 report from the secretary. Commissioner Bluestein, are
5 there any email, public comments?

6 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: All comments that were
7 emailed by 09:45 a.m., were shared with the
8 commissioners and the deputies at 10:00 a.m. And have
9 been provided to each commissioner at the beginning of
10 the meeting and are available at the public comment
11 table. We received one comment from Joan Martini.
12 I've reviewed the comment and asked that be moved into
13 the record.

14 CHAIR SABIR: Yes, you move into the record,
15 please.

16 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: I've also reviewed it and
17 agree it should be moved into the record.

18 CHAIR SABIR: Thank you very much. We will now
19 proceed to old business. We will hear from our newly
20 appointed Director of Election of Operations, Mr.
21 Joseph Lynch.

22 MR. LYNCH: Morning commissioners, I am pleased
23 to provide you with a comprehensive update on our
24 voter registration and election board activities. In
25 our voter registration efforts, we processed a total

1 of 46,831 registration applications including 3,700
2 submitted in the traditional paper format. I am happy
3 to report that all applications are now up to date,
4 and we are meticulously proofing and making necessary
5 corrections to ensure accuracy. It is petition season
6 and we witnessed significant engagement with five
7 petitioners at Delaware and Spring Garden. Our
8 petition checking hours extend from 08:30 am to 07:00
9 p.m. Monday through Thursday, with additional hours on
10 Friday if needed, and over the weekend from 07:00 a.m.
11 until 03:30 p.m. The demand for street list request
12 has also been notably high. Turning our attention to
13 the election board's progress, we successfully
14 dispatched letters on Wednesday, January 24th and
15 emails on Thursday, January 25th. Currently, we have
16 a total of 1,745 dedicated poll workers registered for
17 training.

18 In our most recent training session at United
19 Lutheran on Monday, January 29th, we had the
20 participation of 63 poll workers, and we anticipated a
21 turnout of 65 attendees in yesterday's sessions.
22 Tuesday, January 30th. The County Board of Elections
23 is now accepting mail in absentee ballot applications.
24 Voters on the annual mail in and absentee list will
25 begin receiving their applications next week. To vote

1 by mail in the primary elections, voter must complete
2 and return their application to the County Board of
3 Elections by 05:00 p.m. on April 16th. The option to
4 apply onlinevote.phila.gov is also available. As of
5 yesterday, we have approved 1,518 vote by mail
6 applications, including 294 paper applications and
7 1,224 electronic applications. All processing is up
8 to date including those from civilian, overseas and
9 military voters. A reminder that Wednesday, January
10 3rd or 4th, 2024, is the deadline for Cycle 7 annual
11 reports for transactions through December 31st, 2023.
12 There was a typo in your report, commissioners. I had
13 December 3rd, it should be December 31st, 2023.
14 Candidates, political committees, or former candidates
15 for 2023 who have made expenditures to influence a
16 city election must file a report. Those who filed
17 online must return a signed and notarized cover sheet
18 or a signed cover sheet and unsworn statement to the
19 County Board of Elections by February 10th. Regarding
20 our polling places, we are actively working on
21 addressing any necessary changes to locations and
22 resolving potential conflicts that may have arisen.
23 Thank you for your attention. That's all I have
24 today.

25 CHAIR SABIR: Thank you, Joe.

1 MR. LYNCH: You're welcome.

2 COMMISSIONER DELAWARE: Point of order,
3 commissioner. Is there a report from the Director of
4 Election Administration?

5 CHAIR SABIR: No, Commissioner Deeley there's
6 not.

7 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: I have some questions.

8 CHAIR SABIR: You have some questions for Joe?

9 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: For the Director of
10 Election Administration?

11 CHAIR SABIR: We'll hold up for that second,
12 right now we're just going to stick on other business.

13 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: She is supposed to be given
14 a report to the board every week as per the rules.

15 CHAIR SABIR: Is it -- okay. Thank you, Mr.
16 Lynch. We will now hear from Mr. Capstein with the
17 report from the deputies on our Language Access
18 Committee.

19 MR. CAPSTEIN: Hello, commissioners?

20 CHAIR SABIR: Hello.

21 MR. CAPSTEIN: In keeping with the requirements
22 of 2022's language access expansion motion, the deputy
23 commissioners have prepared a report on the number of
24 ballots cast in Spanish and Chinese on the ExpressVote
25 XLs in the 2023 general. At the division level, there

1 was a total of 2,371 ballots cast on the ExpressVote
2 XLs in Spanish and 493 ballots cast in Chinese. This
3 represents an increase of --

4 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Point of order, please, I'm
5 sorry, because the mic wasn't on.

6 MR. CAPSTEIN: Should I start?

7 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Yeah, you should start over
8 otherwise they won't be able to hear it.

9 MR. CAPSTEIN: Absolutely. Good morning,
10 commissioners. In keeping with the requirements of
11 2022's language access expansion motion, the deputy
12 commissioners have prepared a report on the number of
13 ballots cast in Spanish and Chinese on the ExpressVote
14 XL in the 2023 general at the division level. There
15 was a total of 2,371 ballots cast on the ExpressVote
16 XLs in Spanish and 493 ballots cast in Chinese. This
17 represents an increase of hundreds of voters from each
18 language group compared to the primary of last year.
19 There were 191 voters who either applied to vote by
20 mail in Spanish or who had previously identified a
21 preference for receiving voting materials in Spanish.
22 Of those 128 ballots were returned and counted. There
23 were similarly 87 applications for Chinese ballots of
24 which 55 were returned and counted. This represents a
25 modest increase for each language group compared to

1 the primary of last year. The deputy commissioners
2 are hosting a meeting of the Language Access Advisory
3 Committee on February 8th to receive feedback on the
4 municipal election. We look forward to meeting and
5 hearing from the community about what went well and
6 what more we can do to continue improving our language
7 access program. That's all I have for you.

8 CHAIR SABIR: Thank you, Eric. We will now
9 proceed to new business.

10 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Excuse me, Mr. Chair.
11 Point of order, as per the --

12 CHAIR SABIR: Excuse me, Mrs. Deeley --
13 Commissioner, you're out of order right now.

14 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: I'm out of order?

15 CHAIR SABIR: Yes, because you interrupted me
16 while I was speaking. Like I say, after I finished
17 speaking --

18 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Okay, I'll wait.

19 CHAIR SABIR: -- you cannot speak. Right now.
20 We're going to move over to new business. A motion to
21 pass fiscal year 2025 budget proposal for inclusion
22 and the mayor's proposed budget, pending city council
23 approval. Is there a second?

24 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Can I -- I have a point of
25 order. First of all, before we proceed to the next

1 item on the agenda, I just wanted to point out the
2 general departmental rules that were voted on. It
3 says, the Director of Election Administration and the
4 Director of Election Operations shall be overseen by
5 the board of elections. The Director of Election
6 Administration and Director of Commissioner's Office,
7 and shall report at the board of elections meeting on
8 the activity of the department since the last public
9 meeting. There needs to be a report from both of
10 these individuals.

11 CHAIR SABIR: Okay.

12 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Thank you.

13 CHAIR SABIR: Okay. Madam, are you finished?

14 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: And I do have questions for
15 her.

16 CHAIR SABIR: Okay. So at the end of the day, we
17 have order inside of our meeting. So right now we're
18 here. There is another item that's called other
19 business, so we will be able to address that.

20 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: I have questions related to
21 the budget as well.

22 CHAIR SABIR: Again, I'll read it again, as I was
23 rudely interrupted by Commissioner Deeley. So we'll
24 read again for clarity for the record. I motion to
25 pass fiscal year 2025 budget proposal for inclusion at

1 the mayor's proposed budget, pending city council
2 approvment. Is there a second?

3 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: Mr. Chairman, I do
4 intend to second the motion, although I don't have any
5 concern with Mrs. Reid coming up and answering
6 questions about the budget before we vote.

7 CHAIR SABIR: So, Chairwoman Deeley, is there a
8 question that you're asking our next administration,
9 is it pertaining to the budget?

10 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: I do have budget related
11 questions, Commissioner.

12 CHAIR SABIR: Sure. Would you like to address
13 the budget questions for Commissioner Deeley?

14 MS. REID: Sure. I'd like to read right here
15 (indiscernible).

16 CHAIR SABIR: Okay. Please state your first and
17 last name for the record?

18 MS. REID: Sorry. My name is Stephanie Reid. I
19 apologize. Can you hear me now?

20 CHAIR SABIR: Sure.

21 MS. REID: Stephanie Reid.

22 MR. MIRACLE: Brian Miracle.

23 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Thank you. And my
24 questions are for the Director of Election
25 Administration. As I am confused as to why our budget

1 does not reflect what our full operating costs are.
2 I'm aware that the administration sets certain levels
3 that they ask for our budget submission. However, we
4 are not a department under the mayor's office, we are
5 independently elected. We submit our operating
6 budgets and not beg for additional funds.

7 If the mayor or council wishes to cut our budget,
8 that is their power. However, it is the city's
9 responsibility to fund the elections per the election
10 code. So I would like to see an actual operating
11 budget and that we submit that. Can we do that?

12 MS. REID: I would need to confer with our budget
13 officer and --

14 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: I'm asking you.

15 MS. REID: -- I'll get back to you.

16 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Okay.

17 MS. REID: Yeah.

18 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Because I -- although I do
19 not intend to be petty, but this is the budget that
20 you plan on submitting for fiscal year 2025?

21 MS. REID: Yeah. I guess my question is, where -
22 - can you tell us where you think there's insufficient
23 funds in the budget? And we would be happy to look
24 specifically at that.

25 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Generally speaking, on the

1 71531-S, the total net changes for each responsibility
2 center is not always filled in, which makes this
3 budget a little hard to follow. And there was some
4 stuff added in justifications afterwards that were not
5 included in the budget that I saw. So 71-531, voter
6 registration. It looks like you're moving the voter
7 registration administrator from administration to
8 voter registration. Similar situation as before, it
9 needs to be listed as previously budgeted in
10 administration and newly budgeted in voter
11 registration. Are you willing to correct this?

12 MS. REID: I'm sorry, I don't see the page that
13 you're talking about. I just want to be sure that I'm
14 on the same page that you're on.

15 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: We'll go line by line on a
16 budget.

17 MS. REID: Page. Yeah, I think you said S, but I
18 don't think we have an S is why I was having trouble
19 finding it.

20 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: 71-5315.

21 MS. REID: Registration administrator from -- are
22 you on 7153I?

23 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: I.

24 MS. REID: Yeah, that's what I needed was that
25 last letter. So you said you've got the --

1 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: The voter registration
2 administrator from administration to voter
3 registration.

4 MS. REID: Yeah. I think the placement of the
5 position on the budget can be addressed for sure.

6 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Okay. But it's listed
7 incorrectly. So if this is the budget that we're
8 going to submit, these changes are -- this is why I'm
9 bringing this up. So it looks like you are
10 eliminating the position of computer user support
11 specialist. However, it needs to be listed as
12 previously budgeted in the incremental run and noted
13 as a decrease. Are you willing to correct this?

14 MS. REID: Yes.

15 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Thank you. I see that in
16 the data entry and processing we have a decrease in
17 Clerk 1s by 16. I see that three of them became Clerk
18 2s. Two were shifted to electronic poll book
19 responsibility center. And six you asked back on your
20 additional request. Still I get a reduction of five
21 clerks in the department. Is that correct?

22 MS. REID: That is correct.

23 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Okay.

24 MS. REID: That is based on information that was
25 received from those units. So if there's concern, we

1 could certainly address that.

2 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Because I'm curious why we
3 would be eliminating staff in a presidential year.
4 Was this a cut of five clerks taken into account when
5 we submitted our PER?

6 MS. REID: Yeah, I think it's because the Clerk
7 2s expanded.

8 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: That should be taken in --
9 we took that into account. Three of them became Clerk
10 2s. I'm sorry. Are you looking here for an answer?
11 Three of them became clerk twos.

12 MS. REID: There seems to be input. So yeah, I'm
13 paying attention to everyone. Yeah. So there is a
14 lot of people that have moved due to moving up from
15 Clerk 1s to Clerk 2s to Clerk 3s.

16 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Okay. But this is the
17 budget that we're submitting?

18 MS. REID: Well, actually. So I don't oversee
19 the civil service. So I would actually ask Joe Lynch
20 for his input on that.

21 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: This is the budget that
22 we're submitting.

23 MS. REID: But you're asking me why people were
24 moved the way they were.

25 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: No, it's not what I'm

1 asking. I'm asking why --

2 MS. REID: My responsibility was to put the
3 budget together based on what people told me was
4 needed. So that's what we have done here. I would be
5 happy to either get that together and get it back to
6 you after this meeting or we could have Joe speak to
7 the changes that he thought would be best to run the
8 operation.

9 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Okay. Mr. Lynch why --

10 CHAIR SABIR: Excuse me. Hold on for one second.
11 Again, we're not going to turn this meeting into a
12 circus. You've asked her a question; she answered
13 your question and we're not going to do a debate. As
14 we all know, with budgets. Again, it's a proposed
15 budget, so we'll propose it. We'll negotiate with
16 city council; we'll negotiate with the mayor in order
17 to get this budget. It's not the final budget as it
18 says in the agenda that is proposed. So that's
19 basically it. I believe Chairman Bluestein had a
20 comment as well.

21 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: All right. Thank you,
22 Mr. Sabir.

23 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: I'm sorry. A point of
24 order. The motion on the table is to approve this
25 budget.

1 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
2 I second your motion to send the proposed FY-25 budget
3 to the mayor's administration for inclusion with their
4 proposal City council.

5 CHAIR SABIR: Chairman Bluestein, please call the
6 rule.

7 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: Commissioner Sabir?

8 CHAIR SABIR: I vote aye.

9 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: Commissioner Deeley?

10 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: No.

11 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: I vote aye.

12 CHAIR SABIR: We will now proceed to agenda item
13 B and new business.

14 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: Commissioner Sabir, the
15 Director of Election Administration has brought
16 forward a proposed candidate for Lead GIS Analyst.
17 This is an exempt title. There was an interview
18 process with the city's GIS team and our IT manager.
19 And I would make a motion to hire the proposed
20 candidate for Lead GIS Analyst that was brought before
21 us.

22 CHAIR SABIR: Second.

23 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: I have a question about
24 this motion.

25 CHAIR SABIR: Commissioner Deeley, you're out of

1 order. We called the roll, that is seconded and
2 permission to call the rule.

3 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: Commissioner Sabir?

4 CHAIR SABIR: I vote aye. Excuse me. Now, he
5 can't stop.

6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Any member of the public
7 has the right to object --

8 CHAIR SABIR: Excuse me.

9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: -- to a perceived
10 Sunshine violation at any time during the meeting.

11 CHAIR SABIR: Excuse me, you're not going to yell
12 and scream and turn our meeting into a circus. You're
13 not going to yell and scream as we said earlier.

14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I'm not yelling and
15 screaming.

16 CHAIR SABIR: Yes, you are yelling and you're
17 going --

18 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I'm making an objection.
19 I don't have a microphone. I have to speak up a
20 little.

21 CHAIR SABIR: -- back and forth. Again, we are
22 sitting right here. Can we have other business, or
23 you can make your objection.

24 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I'm making my -- okay.

25 CHAIR SABIR: Okay.

1 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: My objection under the
2 Sunshine act is that the Sunshine act requires that
3 official actions of an agency be discussed, debated,
4 deliberated before the public at a meeting. Every
5 member of this board has the right to comment on any
6 motion that is coming before this board and to discuss
7 the motion and its merits. That is what deliberation
8 before the public means.

9 CHAIR SABIR: Sure. Thank you.

10 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: So this is a violation of
11 the Sunshine Act to prevent members of the board from
12 raising questions and debating an item of business
13 that is before the public.

14 CHAIR SABIR: Noted. I second the motion for
15 Commissioner Bluestein.

16 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Point of order.

17 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: Commissioner Sabir?

18 CHAIR SABIR: I vote aye.

19 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: Commissioner Deeley?

20 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Point of order. All the
21 agenda says --

22 CHAIR SABIR: Commissioner Deeley, do you have a
23 vote on a motion?

24 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: I have a point of order.

25 CHAIR SABIR: Commissioner Deeley to vote. Will

1 you vote?

2 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: I have a point of order.

3 CHAIR SABIR: Commissioner Deeley, we are calling
4 the rule. Do you have a vote? Is it yes or is it no
5 or you're abstaining from the vote?

6 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Point of order. All the
7 agenda says for this is motion to hire a GIS position.
8 I do not believe that this is sufficiently specific
9 enough to meet the Sunshine Act's requirements. As a
10 reasonable person would not be informed enough to know
11 what matters the board may take on. I believe this
12 motion should be tabled until next week when it can be
13 properly noticed with the job title and the
14 candidate's name.

15 CHAIR SABIR: Chairman -- I mean, Commissioner
16 Deeley, if you would like to make a motion for us to
17 be tabled, you need a second for that. I'm not
18 seconding. Commissioner Bluestein, would you second
19 that motion to table that?

20 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: No, Mr. Chairman.

21 CHAIR SABIR: I don't have a motion -- I mean a
22 second for that. So, again, we're rudely interrupted.
23 We'll call the roll again. That's the last time we're
24 going to call this. Commissioner Bluestein, can you
25 make your motion again that way we just clear, because

1 we just rudely interrupted by everyone try to make
2 this meeting a circus. So can you please, for the
3 record, so everything is nice and clear so everyone
4 can understand. Can you please make your motion
5 again?

6 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: The motion is to hire
7 the proposed candidate brought before the
8 commissioners for the lead GI analyst position.

9 CHAIR SABIR: Commissioner Sabir?

10 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: Second the motion.
11 Commissioner Bluestein, please call the roll.

12 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: Commissioner Sabir.

13 CHAIR SABIR: I vote aye.

14 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: Commissioner Deeley?

15 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: Abstain.

16 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: I vote aye.

17 CHAIR SABIR: The motion to hire the GIS position
18 has passed the board. Commissioner Deeley, do you
19 have any other business to be raised at this meeting?

20 COMMISSIONER DEELEY: I do. I would like to read
21 a passage from the rules passed on January 10th, 2024.
22 The Director of Election Administration will manage
23 the hiring process for exempt employees, excluding the
24 commissioners and their individual office staff. In
25 consultation with the deputy commissioners from each

1 office and the Director of Election Operations and
2 shall present such proposed hires to the board of
3 elections. I have a copy of an email here from Joe
4 Lynch to our HR director, sent yesterday morning at
5 08:10 a.m. which is over 24 hours before the scheduled
6 start of this meeting. Directing her to hire a
7 principal assistant at \$70,000 and to make it as of
8 January 22nd, 2024.

9 Nobody was CC'd on this email. The deputies were
10 not consulted until a meeting yesterday. I also do
11 not see it on the agenda for the board. I would like
12 to know, under what authority did the Director of
13 Election Operations have to direct the HR Director to
14 hire and backdate an exempt hire before the deputies
15 and consideration by the board at a public meeting.
16 Would you agree that this would be against the rules
17 from January 10th, 2024? Since this was sent before
18 the deputies were consulted, others had to be involved
19 in this process.

20 CHAIR SABIR: Commissioner Deeley again I heard
21 your statement, I heard your question. We'll address
22 that another time. Commissioner Bluestein, do you
23 have any business that need to be raised at this
24 meeting?

25 COMMISSIONER BLUESTEIN: I have none.

1 CHAIR SABIR: Thank you, Commissioners. Hearing
2 no other business this meeting is adjourned to the
3 chair of the -- I'm tripping, my tongue is -- hearing
4 no other business, this meeting is adjourned to the
5 call of the chair. And I'd like to thank all of our
6 staff for working hard tirelessly. This is
7 unprecedented, presenting budget at the Sunshine
8 meeting. Our department is definitely being more
9 accessible, more transparent, more modernized, and I
10 thank you and we will have the best election, I
11 believe, that we're ever going to have in the history
12 the State of Philadelphia and our presidential
13 election is coming up.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 CERTIFICATE OF TRANSCRIPTIONIST

2

3 I, ERICA PARADYSZ, Legal Transcriptionist, do
4 hereby certify:

5 That the foregoing is a complete and true
6 transcription of the original digital audio recording
7 of the testimony and proceedings captured in the
8 above-entitled matter. As the transcriptionist, I
9 have reviewed and transcribed the entirety of the
10 original digital audio recording of the proceeding to
11 ensure a verbatim record to the best of my ability.

12 I further certify that I am neither attorney for
13 nor a relative or employee of any of the parties to
14 the action; further, that I am not a relative or
15 employee of any attorney employed by the parties
16 hereto, nor financially or otherwise interested in the
17 outcome of this matter.

18

19 IN WITNESS THEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand
20 this 31st day of January, 2023.

21

22

23

24

25

26



Erica Paradysz

<hr/>	16th	17:7,10,15	15:5	accountabil
\$	8:3	<hr/>	71-5315	ity
\$70,000	191	3	15:20	4:25
24:7	10:19	3,700	71531-S	accuracy
<hr/>	1s	7:1	15:1	7:5
0	16:17	30th	7153I	act
03:30	17:15	7:22	15:22	4:6 21:2,
7:11	<hr/>	31st	<hr/>	11
05:00	2	3:5 8:11,	8	Act's
8:3	2,371	13	87	22:9
07:00	10:1,15	3rd	10:23	actions
7:8,10	2022's	8:10,13	8th	21:3
08:10	9:22 10:11	3s	11:3	actively
24:5	2023	17:15	<hr/>	8:20
08:30	8:11,13,15	<hr/>	A	activities
7:8	9:25 10:14	4	a.m.	6:24
09:45	2024	46,831	3:2 6:7,8	activity
6:7	3:5 8:10	7:1	7:10 24:5	12:8
<hr/>	23:21	493	absentee	actual
1	24:8,17	10:2,16	7:23,24	14:10
1,224	2025	4th	Absolutely	added
8:7	11:21	8:10	10:9	15:4
1,518	12:25	<hr/>	Abstain	additional
8:5	14:20	5	23:15	7:9 14:6
1,745	22nd	55	abstaining	16:20
7:16	24:8	10:24	22:5	address
10:00	24	<hr/>	accepting	12:19
6:8	24:5	6	7:23	13:12 17:1
10th	24th	63	access	24:21
8:19 23:21	7:14	7:20	9:17,22	addressed
24:17	25th	65	10:11	16:5
11:00	7:15	7:21	11:2,7	addressing
3:2	294	<hr/>	accessible	8:21
128	8:6	7	5:11 25:9	adjourned
10:22	29th	7	account	25:2,4
16	7:19	8:10	17:4,9	administrat
16:17	2s	71-531		ion
	16:18			9:4,10

12:3,6 13:8,25 14:2 15:7, 10 16:2 19:3,15 23:22 administrat or 15:7,21 16:2 Advisory 11:2 agencies 4:8,9 agency 4:14 21:3 agenda 12:1 18:18 19:12 21:21 22:7 24:11 agree 6:17 24:16 analyst 19:16,20 23:8 annual 7:24 8:10 answering 13:5 anticipated 7:20 apologize 13:19 application 8:2 application s	7:1,3,23, 25 8:6,7 10:23 applied 10:19 apply 8:4 appointed 6:20 approval 11:23 approve 18:24 approved 8:5 approval 13:2 April 8:3 arisen 8:22 assembly 4:6 assistant 24:7 attacks 3:18 attendees 7:21 attention 7:12 8:23 17:13 authority 24:12 aware 14:2 aye	19:8,11 20:4 21:18 23:13,16 <hr/> B back 4:24 14:15 16:19 18:5 20:21 backdate 24:14 ballot 7:23 ballots 9:24 10:1, 2,13,15, 16,22,23 based 16:24 18:3 basically 18:19 beg 14:6 begin 7:25 beginning 6:9 behalf 4:4 Bluestein 5:25 6:4,6 13:3 18:19,21 19:1,5,7, 9,11,14 20:3 21:15,17, 19 22:18, 20,24	23:6,10, 11,12,14, 16 24:22, 25 board 3:4,15,25 4:13,17,18 5:9 6:24 7:22 8:2, 19 9:14 12:5,7 21:5,6,11 22:11 23:18 24:2,11,15 board's 7:13 body 4:24 book 16:18 Brian 13:22 bringing 16:9 brought 19:15,20 23:7 budget 11:21,22 12:21,25 13:1,6,9, 10,13,25 14:3,7,11, 12,19,23 15:3,5,16 16:5,7 17:17,21 18:3,15, 17,25 19:2	25:7 budgeted 15:9,10 16:12 budgets 14:6 18:14 business 3:15 6:19 9:12 11:9, 20 12:19 19:13 20:22 21:12 23:19 24:23 25:2,4 <hr/> C call 3:3 19:5 20:2 22:23,24 23:11 25:5 called 12:18 20:1 calling 22:3 candidate 19:16,20 23:7 candidate's 22:14 candidates 8:14 Capstein 9:16,19,21 10:6,9 care 5:24
--	---	---	--	--

cast 9:24 10:1, 2,13,15,16	change 5:1	Commentator s 3:6	Commissione r's 12:6	congratulat ions 3:24
CC'D 24:9	checking 7:8	comments 3:6,14	commissione rs 3:4,23	considerati on 24:15
center 15:2 16:19	Chinese 9:24 10:2, 13,16,23	6:5,6	6:8,22	consultatio n 23:25
chair 3:3,22 4:1,23 5:8,13,16, 20,23,25 6:2,14,18 8:25 9:5, 8,11,15,20 11:8,10, 12,15,19 12:11,13, 16,22 13:7,12, 16,20 18:10 19:5,8,12, 22,25 20:4,8,11, 16,21,25 21:9,14, 18,22,25 22:3,15,21 23:9,13,17 24:20 25:1,3,5	circus 18:12 20:12 23:2	commissione r 5:9 6:4,6, 9,16 9:2, 3,5,7,9,13 10:4,7 11:10,13, 14,18,24 12:12,14, 20,23 13:3,10, 11,13,23 14:14,16, 18,25 15:15,20, 23 16:1,6, 15,23 17:2,8,16, 21,25 18:9,21,23 19:1,7,9, 10,11,14, 23,25 20:3 21:15,16, 17,19,20, 22,24,25 22:2,3,6, 15,18,20, 24 23:6,9, 10,11,12, 14,15,16, 18,20 24:20,22, 25	8:12 9:19, 23 10:10, 12 11:1 23:8,24,25 25:1	consultatio n 23:25
	city 3:4 8:16 11:22 13:1 18:16 19:4		Committee 9:18 11:3	consulted 24:10,18
	city's 14:8 19:18		committees 8:14	continue 11:6
	civil 17:19		community 11:5	cooperation 5:7
	civilian 8:8		compared 10:18,25	copies 5:21
	clarity 12:24		complete 8:1	copy 24:3
	clear 22:25 23:3		comprehensi ve 6:23	correct 15:11 16:13,21, 22
	clerk 16:17 17:6,9,11, 15		computer 16:10	corrections 7:5
	clerks 16:21 17:4		concern 13:5 16:25	costs 14:1
Chairman 13:3 18:19 19:1,5 22:15,20	code 14:10		conclude 5:13,16	council 11:22 13:1 14:7 18:16 19:4
Chairwoman 13:7	comment 3:9,10,19 5:13,17 6:3,10,11, 12 18:20 21:5		confer 14:12	counted 10:22,24
chance 3:10			conflicts 8:22	County 7:22 8:2, 19
			confused 13:25	cover 8:17,18

curious 17:2	6:16 9:5, 7,9,13	departmenta l 12:2	doors 5:4,7	emails 7:15
cut 14:7 17:4	10:4,7	deputies 6:8 9:17 24:9,14,18	due 17:14	employees 23:23
Cycle 8:10	11:10,12, 14,18,24	deputy 9:22 10:11 11:1 23:25	<hr/> E	end 5:25 12:16
<hr/> D	12:12,14, 20,23	dialogue 3:9	earlier 20:13	engagement 7:6
data 16:16	13:7,10, 13,23	direct 24:13	effort 5:4	enhancement 4:10
date 7:3 8:8	14:14,16, 18,25	Directing 24:6	efforts 6:25	ensure 7:5
day 12:16	15:15,20, 23 16:1,6, 15,23	director 6:20 9:3,9 12:3,4,5,6 13:24 19:15 23:22 24:1,4,12, 13	elected 3:24 14:5	entry 16:16
deadline 8:10	17:2,8,16, 21,25	discretion 3:13	election 3:5 6:20, 24 7:13 8:16 9:4, 10 11:4 12:3,4,5 13:24 14:9 19:15 23:22	Eric 11:8
debate 18:13	18:9,23 19:9,10, 23,25	discriminat ory 3:17	12:3,4,5 13:24 14:9 19:15 23:22	excluding 23:23
debated 21:3	20,22,24, 25 22:2,3, 6,16	discuss 21:6	13:24 14:9 19:15 23:22	Excuse 11:10,12 18:10 20:4,8,11
debating 21:12	23:14,15, 18,20	discussed 21:3	24:1,13 25:10,13	executive 4:17
December 8:11,13	24:20	dispatched 7:14	elections 5:11 7:22 8:1,3,19 12:5,7 14:9 24:3	exempt 19:17 23:23 24:14
decided 4:16	Delaware 7:7 9:2	distribute 5:24	electronic 8:7 16:18	expanded 17:7
decision 4:9	deliberated 21:4	division 9:25 10:14	eliminating 16:10 17:3	expansion 9:22 10:11
decisions 4:15	deliberatio n 4:8 21:7		email 6:5 24:3,9	expenditure s 8:15
decorum 3:16	demand 7:11		emailed 6:7	Expressvote 9:24 10:1, 13,15
decrease 16:13,16	democratic 4:11			
dedicated 7:16	department 12:8 14:4 16:21 25:8			
Deeley				

extend 3:12 7:8	forward 3:20 11:4 19:16	23 10:9	hosting 11:2	individuals 12:10
<hr/>		group 10:18,25	hours 7:8,9 24:5	influence 8:15
F	Friday 7:10	guess 14:21	HR 24:4,13	information 16:24
fairest 5:11	full 14:1	<hr/>	hundreds 10:17	informed 22:10
February 8:19 11:3	functioning 4:10	H	<hr/>	input 17:12,20
feedback 11:3	fund 14:9	happy 7:2 14:23 18:5	I	inside 12:17
file 8:16	funds 14:6,23	hard 15:3 25:6	identified 10:20	insufficien
filed 8:16	FY-25 19:2	hear 6:19 9:16 10:8 13:19	important 4:25	t 14:22
filled 15:2	<hr/>	heard 24:20,21	improving 11:6	intend 13:4 14:19
final 18:17	G	hearing 11:5 25:1, 3	included 15:5	interrupted 11:15 12:23 22:22 23:1
Finally 3:15	Garden 7:7	held 4:17	including 7:1 8:6,8	interview 19:17
finding 15:19	Garella 3:21,23 4:3 5:14, 18,21,24	high 7:12	inclusion 11:21 12:25 19:3	involved 24:18
finished 11:16 12:13	general 4:6 9:25 10:14 12:2	hire 19:19 22:7 23:6,17 24:6,14	incorrectly 16:7	item 12:1,18 19:12 21:12
fiscal 11:21 12:25 14:20	Generally 14:25	hires 24:2	increase 10:3,17,25	<hr/>
follow 4:15 15:3	germane 3:14	hiring 23:23	incremental 16:12	J
forbidden 4:18	GI 23:8	history 25:11	independent 14:5	January 3:5 7:14, 15,19,22 8:9 23:21 24:8,17
format 7:2	GIS 19:16,18, 20 22:7 23:17	hold 5:25 9:11 18:10	indiscernib	
formulation 4:9	Good 3:3,21,22,		le 13:15	
			individual 23:24	Joan 6:11

job 22:13	11	19:18	mic 10:5	moving 15:6 17:14
Joe 8:25 9:8 17:19 18:6 24:3	live 3:7	Martini 6:11	microphone 20:19	municipal 11:4
Joseph 6:21	locations 8:21	materials 10:21	military 8:9	_____
justificati ons 15:4	lot 17:14	matters 22:11	minutes 3:12	N
_____	Lutheran 7:19	mayor 14:7 18:16	Miracle 13:22	needed 7:10 15:24 18:4
K	lynch 6:21,22 9:1,16 17:19 18:9	mayor's 11:22 13:1 14:4 19:3	modernized 25:9	negotiate 18:15,16
keeping 9:21 10:10	24:4	means 21:8	modest 10:25	net 15:1
_____	_____	meet 22:9	Monday 7:9,19	newly 6:19 15:10
L	M	meeting 3:4 6:1,10 11:2,4 12:7,9,17 18:6,11 20:10,12 21:4 23:2, 19 24:6, 10,15,24 25:2,4,8	morning 3:3,21,22, 23 6:22 10:9 24:4	nice 23:3
language 9:17,22 10:11,18, 25 11:2,6	Madam 12:13	meetings 3:16 4:7, 15,19 5:22	motion 9:22 10:11 11:20 12:24 13:4 18:24 19:2,19,24 21:6,7,14, 23 22:7, 12,16,19, 21,25 23:4,6,10, 17	notably 7:12
law 4:21	made 8:15	member 20:6 21:5	move 6:3,14 11:20	notarized 8:17
lead 19:16,20 23:8	mail 7:23,24 8:1,5 10:20	members 4:18 21:11	moved 6:12,17 17:14,24	noted 16:12 21:14
letter 15:25	make 19:19	merits 21:7		noticed 22:13
letters 7:14	makes 15:2	meticulousl y 7:4		number 9:23 10:12
level 9:25 10:14	making 4:9,14 7:4 20:18,24			_____
levels 14:2	manage 23:22			O
list 7:11,24	manager			object 20:7
listed 15:9 16:6,				objection 20:18,23 21:1
				offer 3:19 5:3

offering 3:19	24 22:2,6	person 22:10	political 8:14	16:12
office 12:6 14:4 23:24 24:1	overseas 8:8	personal 3:17	poll 7:16,20 16:18	primary 8:1 10:18 11:1
officer 14:13	oversee 17:18	pertaining 13:9	polling 8:20	principal 24:7
official 21:3	overseen 12:4	petition 7:5,8	position 16:5,10 22:7 23:8, 17	proceed 6:19 11:9, 25 19:12
online 8:17	<hr/> P	petitioners 7:7	positions 3:25	process 4:11 19:18 23:23 24:19
onlinevote.	p.m. 7:9,11 8:3	petty 14:19	potential 8:22	processed 6:25
phila.gov 8:4	paper 7:2 8:6	Philadelphi	power 14:8	processing 8:7 16:16
opaque 4:13	participati	a 3:4,8 4:14 5:8,12 25:12	powers 4:23	profane 3:17
open 4:19 5:4,6	on 7:20	Philly 4:4,5	pre-written 4:15	program 11:7
operating 14:1,5,10	pass 11:21 12:25	placement 16:4	preference 10:21	progress 7:13
operation 18:8	passage 23:21	places 8:20	prepared 9:23 10:12	proofing 7:4
Operations 6:20 12:4 24:1,13	passed 4:22 23:18,21	plan 14:20	present 4:7 24:2	proper 4:10
opportunity 3:9	paying 17:13	pleased 6:22	presenting 25:7	properly 22:13
option 8:3	pending 11:22 13:1	plenty 5:5	preserve 3:16	proposal 11:21 12:25 19:4
order 3:3,16 9:2 10:4 11:11,13, 14,25 12:17 18:16,24 20:1 21:16,20,	Pennsylvani	point 9:2 10:4 11:11,24 12:1 18:23 21:16,20, 24 22:2,6	presidential 17:3 25:12	propose 18:15
	a 4:5	policy 4:8	prevent 21:11	proposed 11:22 13:1 18:14,18 19:2,16,19
	people 17:14,23 18:3		previously 10:20 15:9	
	perceived 20:9			
	permission 20:2			

23:7 24:2	raising	6:24,25	requirement	
Protect	21:12	7:1 15:6,	s	S
4:4	read	7,8,11,21	9:21 10:10	Sabir
provide	12:22,24	16:1,3	22:9	3:3,22 4:1
6:23	13:14	Reid	requires	5:9,13,16,
provided	23:20	13:5,14,	21:2	20,23 6:2,
6:9	ready	18,21	resident	14,18 8:25
public	5:6,9,10	14:12,15,	3:7 4:5	9:5,8,11,
3:6,9,10,	real	17,21	resolving	15,20
14,19 4:7,	5:4	15:12,17,	8:22	11:8,12,
19 5:2,3,	reasonable	21,24	responsibil	15,19
8,10 6:3,	22:10	16:4,14,	ity	12:11,13,
5,10 12:8	receive	22,24	3:15 14:9	16,22
20:6 21:4,	11:3	17:6,12,	15:1 16:19	13:7,12,
8,13 24:15	received	18,23 18:2	18:2	16,20
put	6:11 16:25	related	return	18:10,22
18:2	receiving	12:20	8:2,17	19:5,7,8,
	7:25 10:21	13:10	returned	12,14,22,
Q	recent	relationshi	10:22,24	25 20:3,4,
Q&a	7:18	P	reviewed	8,11,16,
3:10 5:16	recommenda	5:2	6:12,16	21,25
question	tions	relevant	Rich	21:9,14,
5:1,19	5:5,22	3:14	4:3 6:2	17,18,22,
13:8 14:21	record	remains	roll	25 22:3,
18:12,13	4:2 6:13,	5:1	20:1 22:23	15,21
19:23	14,17	reminder	23:11	23:9,12,
24:21	12:24	8:9	rudely	13,17
questions	13:17 23:3	report	12:23	24:20 25:1
4:20 9:7,8	reduction	6:4 7:3	22:22 23:1	scheduled
12:14,20	16:20	8:12,16	rule	24:5
13:6,11,	reflect	9:3,14,17,	19:6 20:2	scream
13,24	14:1	23 10:12	22:4	20:12,13
21:12	reflected	12:7,9	rules	screaming
	5:2	reports	4:22 9:14	20:15
R	registered	8:11	12:2 23:21	scripts
raised	7:16	represents	24:16	4:16
23:19	registratio	10:3,17,24	run	season
24:23	n	request	16:12 18:7	7:5
		7:11 16:20		seconded
				20:1

seconding 22:18	5:18	staff 17:3 23:24	7:13	tirelessly 25:6
secretary 6:4	simplest 4:20	25:6	sufficientl y 22:8	title 19:17
secretive 4:14	sitting 20:22	stand 5:6	suggestions 5:6	22:13
secure 5:11	situation 15:8	start 3:6 10:6,7	sun 5:5	today 8:24
send 19:2	slanderous 3:17	24:6	Sunshine 4:6 5:22	told 18:3
serve 5:3	South 4:5	state 3:7 4:1	20:10	tolerated 3:18
service 17:19	Spanish 9:24 10:2,	13:16	21:2,11	tongue 25:3
session 7:18	13,16,20,	statement 8:18 24:21	22:9 25:7	total 6:25 7:16
sessions 4:17 7:21	21	step 3:19	support 16:10	10:1,15
sets 14:2	speak 11:19 18:6	Stephanie 13:18,21	supposed 9:13	15:1
shared 6:7	20:19	stick 9:12	<hr/>	traditional 7:2
sheet 8:17,18	speaker 3:11 20:6,	stop 20:5	T	training 7:17,18
shifted 16:18	9,14,18,24	street 7:11	table 6:11 18:24	transaction s
shine 5:5	21:1,10	stuff 15:4	22:19	8:11
signed 8:17,18	speaking 4:4,18	submission 14:3	tabled 22:12,17	transparenc y 4:25
significant 7:6	11:16,17	submit 14:5,11	talking 15:13	transparent 25:9
Similar 15:8	14:25	16:8	taxpayer 3:8	tripping 25:3
similarly 10:23	specialist 16:11	submitted 7:2 17:5	team 19:18	trouble 15:18
simple	specific 22:8	submitting 14:20	thought 18:7	Tuesday 7:22
	specificall y 14:24	17:17,22	Thursday 7:9,15	turn 18:11
	spirit 5:7	successfull y	time 3:12 20:10	20:12
	Spring 7:7		22:23	
			24:22	

turned 4:13	21:10	22:12	yesterday 8:5 24:4, 10
Turning 7:12	vital 4:9	weekend 7:10	yesterday's 7:21
turnout 7:21	vote 4:4 7:25 8:5 10:19	weeks 4:22	
twos 17:11	13:6 19:8, 11 20:4	wishes 14:7	
typo 8:12	21:18,23, 25 22:1,4, 5 23:13,16	wishing 3:18	
<hr/>		witnessed 7:6	
U	voted 12:2	work 5:10	
understand 23:4	voter 6:24,25	workers 7:16,20	
unexplained 4:17	8:1 15:5, 6,8,10	working 8:20 25:6	
UNIDENTIFIE D	16:1,2	<hr/>	
20:6,9,14, 18,24 21:1,10	voters 7:24 8:9 10:17,19	X	
United 7:18	votes 4:16	XL 10:14	
units 16:25	voting 5:8 10:21	XLS 9:25 10:2, 16	
unprecedented ed	<hr/>	<hr/>	
25:7	W	Y	
unsworn 8:18	wait 11:18	year 10:18 11:1,21 12:25 14:20 17:3	
update 6:23	wanted 12:1	years 4:12,23	
user 16:10	watching 4:12	yell 20:11,13	
<hr/>	Wednesday 3:5 7:14 8:9	yelling 20:14,16	
V	week 7:25 9:14		
violation 20:10			